



MINUTES
Committee of the Whole
Monday, May 20, 2019 @ 5:00 p.m.
Tony Benavides Lansing City Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER

Council Member Wood called the meeting called to order at 5:02 p.m.

PRESENT

Councilmember Kathie Dunbar- excused
Councilmember Jeremy A. Garza
Councilmember Adam Hussain
Council Member Brian T. Jackson
Councilmember Peter Spadafore
Councilmember Patricia Spitzley
Councilmember Jody Washington
Councilmember Carol Wood

OTHERS PRESENT

Sherrie Boak, Council Staff
Eric Brewer, Council Internal Auditor
Jim Smiertka, City Attorney
Angela Bennett, Finance Director
Samantha Harkins, Executive Staff, Mayor's Office
Mayor Schor-arrived at 5:07 p.m.
Loretta Stanaway
Linda Kiefe
Elaine Fields

Minutes

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM MAY 9, 2019 AS PRESENTED. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM MAY 13, 2019 AS PRESENTED. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

Public Comment on Agenda Items

Ms. Stanaway spoke in support of the change to Townsend Ramp funds being used in part for the Red Cedar Floodplain Remapping, she also supported fees for the cemeteries in the proposed budget. Ms. Stanaway then spoke about the Sunken Garden plantings, and asked if there was an RFP for plantings and where those funds came from.

Ms. Kiefe spoke on support of funds for a sustainability manager.

Discussion/Action:

RESOLUTION – Consider Supplemental Appropriation; Revenue from the sale of the Townsend Parking Ramp

Mayor Schor stated that they provided the original resolution and after discussions with Council leadership they were now asking Committee to consider a substitute which would remove the spending on going paperless and adding in \$181,500 for the Red Cedar Floodplain Remapping and \$318,500 into sidewalk repairs in addition to what was already proposed in the budget for sidewalk repairs.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO CONSIDER A SUBSTITUTE ON THE SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATION ON THE FUNDS FROM THE SALE OF THE TOWNSEND PARKING RAMP.

Council Member Jackson asked how many votes to reconsider and Mr. Smiertka was not able to answer at this time.

MOTION CARRIED TO CONSIDER A SUBSTITUTE PROPOSED BY THE MAYOR 7-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE SUBSTITUTE RESOLUTION FOR THE SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATION; REVENUE FROM THE SALE OF THE TOWNSEND PARKING RAMP.

Council Member Jackson spoke in opposition to the substitute, because in his opinion it was missing the environmental and sustainability portion and these funds could have been used for that. Council Member Washington spoke in support of the resolution and acknowledged the Mayor for the collaboration on the substitute which addresses most constituents in her Ward in addition to the repairs to the sidewalks. Council Member Spadafore acknowledged the Mayor for working with Council and spoke in support to the approach on paperless but understand it could be done later down the road. Council Member Hussain acknowledged Council Member Washington for the action she took for her Ward on the remapping and spoke in support of the Mayor's action on the substitute. Council Member Spitzley acknowledged the Committee and Mayor for their coordination on this substitute and noted there is an opportunity for sustainability with the BWL or an opportunity for a Liaison in the Mayor's office on collaboration.

Council Member Spadafore stepped away from the meeting at 5:18 p.m.

Council Member Spitzley continued by also stating that Council can look at sustainability in the future a full time position, but with budget as it needs to be now, it would not be this year.

Council Member Spadafore returned to the meeting at 5:19 p.m.

Mr. Smiertka responded to the earlier question by Council Member Jackson, stating that last week there were emails sent to Council on this subject and legal opinions on Supplemental Appropriations procedures. This is not subject to being able to amend on the Council floor by Council. The motion to reconsider requires five (5) votes and the substitute requires six (6) votes.

Council Member Garza stated his support of the recent changes by the Mayor, but was still not in support of \$100,000 for a new City website. Council Member Jackson made a statement that if it is \$800,000 to construct 1 mile of road, why cannot there be consideration for what he

believed was 1/8 of that for a sustainability and environmental position. He concluded he would support this resolution, because all the priorities are great, but he is still looking to discuss the sustainability and environmental position.

Council President Wood stated to the public and Committee that when the resolution was first approved by Committee they held discussions before it went to Council for adoption and heard suggestions from Council Members on other spending. So Council leadership approached the Mayor, and she acknowledged him for working on the proposals with Council. She concluded that these funds are a one-time fund, and a lot of public safety issues will be addressed with them.

Mayor Schor assured Council he will have future energy sources and options and continues to work with Public Service.

MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

ORDINANCE– Re-Adoption of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Lansing
MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE RESOLUTION FOR THE READOPTION OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF LANSING.

Council Member Spadafore noted that this covers 10 years, and this process will be done annually with the budget in the future.

MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

DISCUSSION – Budget and Budget Policies

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPITZLEY TO REDUCE FUNDS FROM THE GENERAL FUND GREENWISE MAYOR'S PROPOSAL IN THE AMOUNT OF \$104,701 AND MOVE THE FUNDING TO A NEW POSITION ; CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER.

Council Member Spitzley then referred to a spreadsheet that each member had in front of them outlining the reduction from each department. Council Member Spadafore noted that it was not the percentage spent on unfunding where things could be used on LPD and LFD. Council Member Washington spoke to stopping all initiatives until the Chief Strategy Officer is hired, and they can then report out what the City has and address the issues. Council Member Jackson referenced his handout on the Sustainability Manager and read the description, and asked Council to take this position into consideration to address energy issues. Council President Wood referred the Committee to the Council Policies and the proposed addition by of "Chief Strategy Officer – The Lansing City Council is establishing a Chief Strategy Officer. City Council will work with the Administration, Financial Health Team and Unions to establish an ordinance and/or contract outlining expectations and reporting. This process will begin no later than June 30, 2019." The second paragraph she added was a recommendation from the FHT. "After the establishment of a Chief Strategy Officer, City Council will also consider the appointment of a standing committee to exam the recommendations from the Chief Strategy Office and issues involving the long term liabilities. Council Member Garza, Spitzley and Hussain spoke in support of the position. Council Member Jackson agreed that the pension liability is important, and supported the no appeal with the State when the City filed the appeal, and understood the FHT reviewed the budget and provided a recommendation, but in his opinion it is the Administrations job to work with the departments to reduce their budget, so he would not support this motion. Council Member Spadafore confirmed in the leadership discussions with the Mayor, there was support for the \$180,000 in enterprise funds to energy and looking to invest in energy efficiencies. Therefore the appropriation is still part of the budget, just not specifically in the GF budget mentioned

earlier. Council Member Hussain added that out of the \$285,000 that was going to be spent, they weren't going to make more efficient buildings and not going to reduce carbon with that amount. Now with the \$185,000 in the enterprise funds they will attempt to do some of those things, so at some point the City can move towards it. Council President Wood pointed out that moving forward with the studies that are being performed this year, the future budget might be able to address.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO REDUCE FUNDS IN ARTS AND CULTURES GRANTS BY \$12,500 AND MOVE THE FUNDING TO A NEW CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER POSITION.

Council Member Spadafore noted that this would not be eliminating the program, but reducing the amount the Mayor proposed to increase it by.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO REDUCE FUNDS IN FAÇADE GRANTS IN THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING DEPARTMENT BY \$12,500 AND MOVE THE FUNDING TO A NEW CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER POSITION.

Council Member Spadafore noted that this would not be eliminating the program, but reducing the amount the Mayor proposed to increase it by.

Council Member Hussain spoke in support of the Façade Grant, and not in this reduction, however he noted that he did support the new position of Chief Strategy Officer so would support the reduction at this time. Council Member Washington concurred with Council Member Hussain. Council Member Jackson stated he could not support it because the funds were not going towards initiatives and in his opinion the constituents were demanding there more environment concerns. Council President Wood also concurred with statements by Council Member Hussain and supported the façade grant program.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO REDUCE THE APPROPRIATIONS TO SISTER CITIES IN THE AMOUNT OF \$5,000 AND MOVE THE FUNDS TO A NEW CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER POSITION.

Council Member Spadafore explained that there was \$20,000 in Sister Cities last year, and there was the hope the division would be self-sustaining and this slight reduction might encourage them to pursue that sustainability.

This would bring the new total for a Chief Strategy Officer to \$134,701.

Council Member Spitzley spoke in support of the motion. Council Member Jackson spoke in opposition to the reduction, supporting all that Sister Cities does. Council President Wood pointed out the reduction would not eliminate Sister Cities, but when it was created they were to obtain a 501c3 to support themselves.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER HUSSAIN TO REDUCE THE PERSONNEL LINE BY \$60,000 IN NEIGHBORHOODS AND CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT AND MOVE THE FUNDS TO A NEW CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER POSITION.

Council Member Hussain then noted he does support the department itself. Council Member Spadafore stated he could not support the reduction because he sees the positive work being doing in and for the neighborhoods. Council Member Washington spoke in opposition to the Department and its Director who in her opinion was not assisting the City because she was never here and in her opinion the City needs a Director needs to be working in the City and hiring another position in that department would not help that. Council Member Spitzley stated she would support the motion, but not support an override of a Mayor's veto. Council Member Jackson asked if they have any consideration for a Sustainability Director that was outlined in his handout to address the duties of the Chief Strategy Officer and concluded by asking if anyone thought the Administration should determine. Council Member Hussain reiterated that he supported the department itself, but the funds of \$60,000 are needed somewhere else. Council Member Washington also reiterated her earlier statement that she supported the department and clarified for the public that with reducing \$60,000 they are not eliminating the department. She concluded, in response to the statement made by Council Member Spitzley, that she would support an override of a Mayor's veto. Council Member Garza briefly stated his support of the new Chief Strategy Officer and asked for consideration to name it Chief Financial Officer. Council Member Jackson stated for the record he has had no discussions on what happens after Council votes tonight. Council President Wood asked Ms. Bennet if the full \$60,000 was in personnel or if Council Member Hussain needed to amend his motion, and she was not able to immediately answer but stated she would confirm. Council President Wood spoke about the staffing in the Council offices and their interest to increase the staff from three, however with the importance of the new Chief Strategy Officer, Council too is not pursuing adding staff to their department.

Mayor Schor noted Council thus far has changed his budget four (4) times, and he disagreed with Council Member Washington's statements on the Director of Neighborhood and Citizen Engagement traveling, in fact he noted a lot of his Directors travel to promote the City. Council President Wood clarified that the changes he referenced is only .17% of the budget, so not a lot. Council Member Washington concluded the discussion by stating it is Council's job to recommend changes and she would respectively agree to disagree with the Mayor.

Council Member Hussain asked Ms. Bennett if she determined if he needed to amend his motion. Ms. Bennett stated that all \$60,000 should come out of the Personnel line item.

MOTION CARRIED 5-2.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON TO REDUCE THE CITY ATTORNEY PERSONNEL LINE ITEM BY \$60,000 AND REDUCE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BY \$100,000 FROM THE PROPOSED INCREASE FOR CODE ENFORCEMENT AND MOVE THE FUNDS TO CREATE A NEW SUSTAINABILITY MANAGER.

Council Member Jackson read the description on the document he distributed to Council. "Is responsible for managing, coordinating, facilitating, and advising the development, implementation, monitoring, and improvement of local government policies, programs, and initiatives that promote local environmental, energy, economic, and social sustainability.

Council President Wood asked Ms. Bennett if they took \$60,000 from the City Attorney, if that would eliminate a position because a position would then be unfunded. Ms. Bennett confirmed. Council President Wood then asked if the proposed \$100,000 reduction was under

Building Safety, and Ms. Bennett stated it would be in the GF of Economic Development & Planning. Council President Wood then asked if there is \$90,000 for this proposed position by Council Member Jackson, does it need to be doubled for benefits. Ms. Bennett stated it would depend on the position itself. In the first year there is a reallocation for legacy costs, so roughly \$30,000 for benefits, totaling \$120,000 of the proposed \$160,000. Council Member Spitzley restated that she voted against \$60,000 for a new position in NCE so would not vote for this. She supported the new Chief Strategy Officer and in her opinion could address these items as well. What she also suggested was a liaison in the Mayor's office to work with BWL on some of Council Member Jackson's items. Council Member Garza did not support reducing funds from Code Enforcement because in his opinion code enforcement was vital to the City. Council Member Spadafore asked Ms. Bennett how much of the Code Enforcement positions is supported by fees, and Ms. Bennett answered that \$80,000 is offset by the revenue. Council Member Spadafore pointed out to Council that with this it would be \$100,000 from Code Enforcement, \$60,000 from Office of the City Attorney and then \$80,000 in revenue loss. Council Member Hussain acknowledged Council Member Jackson for his considerations on the subject, however stated that this would be the "cart before horse" until the Climate Action Plan was completed and reported. In regards to taking \$100,000 from Code, he strongly opposed that because they need more officers. Council Member Jackson appealed his determination on the motion stating he got his information from the local experts, and was now open to other ideas from Council to make this work. Council Member Spadafore also acknowledged him for his efforts, but concurred that in the next year's budget they will have results from the Climate Action Plan and the Council will be able to see the vision of where to go next. Council President Wood pointed out that with code there are revenues, and if Council will to eliminate that position and revenue, the budget has to balance and therefore he would need to demonstrate creating fees to make it work. She then read the item in the proposed Budget Policy by Council Member Jackson for Environmental Stewardship. "The City of Lansing is concerned about its environment and strives to be a good steward of such. The City recognizes the importance of sustainability and shall affirmatively make progress towards its commitment to the goals in the Paris Agreement. The City will take a proactive approach and appropriate funds to reduce the City's net emissions output, increase its energy efficiency and improve its wastewater treatment and waste management programs." Council Member Washington spoke in support of the energy topic, however was not in support of additional funding until there was a comprehensive plan and list of what City buildings are effected. Council Member Jackson reiterated he received all his information and talking points from local experts who suggest what he is proposing and what they are looking at for the Chief Strategy Officer is what the Sustainability Manager can also look into.

MOTION FAILED 1-6.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBE JACKSON TO REDUCE EACH DEPARTMENTS BUDGET EQUALLY BY PERSONNEL TO TOTAL \$100,000 AND REDUCE THE CITY ATTORNEY OFFICE PERSONNEL LINE BY \$60,000. MOTION FAILED 1-6.

Ms. Bennett asked where the funding that was getting moved from accounts to a fund for the Chief Strategy Officer would be going. Council President Wood stated she would need to create a new account and it would be in the Mayor's office operating line item budget, and Council will work with the Mayor and Administration on an ordinance and contract.

Policies

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER HUSSAIN TO REMOVE "CORRIDOR FAÇADE GRANTS". MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO ADD NON-MOTORIZED VEHICLE SAFETY- PUBLIC SERVICE IS ENCOURAGED TO DEVELOP A STRATEGY AND PROGRAM TO PROTECT BIKE LANES AT BUSY INTERSECTIONS TO INCREASE RIDER SAFETY AND EDUCATE MOTORISTS ON PROPER INTERACTION WITH BIKE LANES AT INTERSECTIONS. IF POSSIBLE THE BARRIERS SHOULD BE REMOVED TO FACILITATE STREET SWEEPING AND SNOW PLOWING. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON TO ADD ENVIRONMENTAL STEWARDSHIP – THE CITY OF LANSING IS CONCERNED ABOUT ITS ENVIRONMENT AND STRIVES TO BE A GOOD STEWARD OF SUCH. THE CITY RECOGNIZES THE IMPORTANCE OF SUSTAINABILITY AS DETERMINED IN ITS COMMITMENT TO THE GOALS IN THE PARIS AGREEMENT. THE CITY WILL RECOGNIZE A PROACTIVE APPROACH AND WORK TO USE \$175,300 IN NON-GENERAL FUND DOLLARS TO REDUCE THE CITY'S NET EMISSIONS OUTPUT, INCREASE ITS ENERGY EFFICIENCY AND IMPROVE ITS WASTEWATER TREATMENT AND WASTE MANAGEMENT PROGRAMS. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

Per a request by the Administration an addition of Lansing Home Ownership Program for Employees (L-Home). Council Member Spadafore noted that there needs to be better marketing on the program because the real estate agents he has spoken to were not aware of the program.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO ADD LANSING HOME OWNERSHIP PROGRAM FOR EMPLOYEES (L-HOME)- L-HOME SHALL COVER THESE GROUPS, ALL FULL TIME AND PART TIME YEAR ROUND EMPLOYEES, WHOSE BARGAINING UNITS HAVE AGREED TO PARTICIPATE IN THE PROGRAM, AND THE FOLLOWING NON-BARGAINING EMPLOYEE GROUPS: EXECUTIVE MANAGEMENT GROUP, NON-BARGAINING GROUP, MAYORAL STAFF, DISTRICT COURT EMPLOYEES, AND THE CITY COUNCIL STAFF EMPLOYEES, AND SHALL CONTINUE AS FUNDED. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO ADD THE CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER POSITION OUTLINE. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

RESOLUTION- City of Lansing FY2019/2020 Budget and Policies

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER WOOD TO DIVIDE OUT THE QUESTION TO REMOVE THE HRCS BUDGET. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPITZLEY TO DIVIDE OUT THE QUESTION TO REMOVE THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & PLANNING BUDGET BECAUSE HER EMPLOYER DOES OBTAIN FUNDS FROM THAT BUDGET. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL PRESIDENT WOOD TO RECUSE HERSELF FROM THE HRCS BUDGET BECAUSE HER EMPLOYER DOES OBTAIN FUNDS FROM THAT BUDGET. MOTION TO RECUSE CARRIED 6-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON TO DIVIDE OUT THE QUESTION TO REMOVE THE DISTRICT COURT BUDGET BECAUSE OF HIS JOB WITH INGHAM COUNTY PUBLIC DEFENDERS OFFICE. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON TO RECUSE HIMSELF FROM THE DISTRICT COURT BUDGET. MOTION CARRIED 6-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE DISTRICT COURT BUDGET. MOTION CARRIED 6-0 WITH 1 RECUSSAL.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBE SPITZLEY TO RECUSE HERSELF FROM THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING BUDGET. MOTION CARRIED 6-0.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING BUDGET. MOTION CARRIED 5-1 NAY (JACKSON) 1 RECUSSAL

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE HRCS BUDGET. MOTION CARRIED 6-0 WITH 1 RECUSSAL

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE FY 2019/2020 BUDGET AND POLICIES.

Council Member Jackson acknowledged the Committee on their deliberations.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1.

Executive Order 2019-04; Transfer of all UAW 400 Parking Enforcement Workers from the Lansing Police Department to the Economic Development & Planning Department

Council President Wood pointed out that by approving the budget Council have approved the Executive Order.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO ACCEPT AND PLACE ON FILE THE EXECUTIVE ORDER 2019-04. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by,

Sherrie Boak, Recording Secretary

Lansing City Council

Approved by the Committee on June 3, 2019