



**MINUTES**  
**Committee on Personnel**  
**Thursday, June 2, 2016 @3:30 p.m.**  
**10<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room, City Hall**

**CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 3:31 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

Council Member Jessica Yorko, Chairperson  
Council Member Judi Brown Clarke, Vice Chairperson  
Council Member Patricia Spitzley, Member  
Council Member Jody Washington, Member- excused

**OTHERS PRESENT**

Sherrie Boak, Council Staff  
Mark Dotson, Deputy City Attorney  
Jim DeLine, Internal Auditor  
Phil Perkins, BWL Auditor  
Jimmy Tonney, Robert Half  
Kuzian Gamboa, Student  
Mai-Maiaa Crystal Her, Student

**MINUTES**

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPITZLEY TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM MAY 19, 2016 AS PRESENTED. MOTION CARRIED 3-0.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

No public comment.

**DISCUSSION/ACTION**

**City Council Internal Auditor Position- T**

Council Member Yorko acknowledged Mr. Perkins for his input on the earlier draft and draft questions. The job description was changed to reflect the change to "Job Title: Internal Auditor 42", and under Education and Experience Requirements a CISA Certification was added. This would add experience in IT audits. Council Member Spitzley asked if there were funds in the Internal Audit Budget for training, and Mr. DeLine confirmed there was not a specific line item, however in FY16-17 Council did increase the miscellaneous budget to provide training for the new auditor. Council Member Brown Clarke asked Mr. Perkins what the cost of training for CISA would cost, and he noted the exam itself could run \$100, then a \$200 a year certification.

The Committee reviewed the interview questions that Council Member Yorke created and distributed. Council Member Spitzley asked on question #2 of "Expertise in the Field" for clarification, and Council Member Yorke noted this question spoke to if the applicant is at a senior level or progression in their career. The group added "throughout your career.." instead of "during your career". Ms. Black suggested adding "in this field" at the end of the question. In question #6, Council Member Brown Clarke asked about the systems "Enterprise Resource Planning" used. Mr. Perkins noted it was a broad area, and each organization has modules that the applicant should be familiar with. Council Member Brown Clarke asked if it would clarify it if it stated "tell us your experience or knowledge or way to use Enterprise...". Or "what is your proficiency with the system". Council Member Yorke added to the conversation that "frequency of use" would indicate their experience, and Council Member Spitzley suggested "In your current or most recent job, what is your proficiency in the modules and what other systems are you using." Council Member Brown Clarke pointed out that the draft question appears to have two questions in it; What is their expertise in ERP, and secondarily what system are they using. Council Member Yorke stated she would work on re-wording the question.

In question #7, Council Member Brown Clarke suggested adding "respective" before "audiences". Council Member Yorke stated that doing that make the question confusing. Under questions for Interpersonal Relations, Problem-Solving, Communication & Confidentiality, the group consensus was to move questions #7 higher up on the sheet, and combine question #1 & #2. Council Member Yorke stated she would re-write the questions.

After the review of the questions, the Committee discussed the process for scoring of the questions, submission to the EEO Board, and exam prior to the interview, and outside testing. Ms. Black informed the Committee that before submission to the EEO the questions will need to be weighted with a point system, and during the interview process it was encouraged that the Committee document their decisions for the rationale in case they are challenged on the qualifications and job offer. At the end of the interview process all the documentation from the interview is stored in HR including the rating sheets, and scratch notes. The EEO will get a spreadsheet with the scoring information. Ms. Banks reminded the Committee that if they will be rating the applicants on presentation and communication skills that also needs to be noted at stated in the packet going to the EEO before the process starts. The Committee asked Mr. Dotson his opinion on what needs to be submitted and saved, and he stated there is an exemption for the questions being used because the questions should never be released to the public; an exemption in how information is provided in the application, and an inter-agency exemption, and candidate dialogue with the group

Council Member Yoro stated her opinion on why no written exam should be performed, since this is a specialized position, and that the availability and usefulness of an exam would be limiting. She suggested that the applicants provide two examples of what they have developed, and the Committee can create and exercise they can do as part of the interview and asked Mr. Perkins for his assistance in creating that exercise. Council Member Brown Clarke asked Mr. Tonney if Robert Half has a generalized exam that they could administer. Council Member Spitzley agreed with using an exercise through a third party, but asked how that would be evaluated. Council Staff reminded the Committee that if an exercise or test is to be required the answers would also have to be provided with the exercise to the EEO Board as part of the package before even the posting is done. Mr. Tonney acknowledged that this position is a specialized position, and therefore would have to refer to Mr. Perkins on creating an exercise. Mr. Perkins acknowledged his experience in the past has been no exercise during an interview, but if Committee wanted to go that route he could create one using the sample CQA exam for a template of questions. The Committee agreed to that ,and also agreed that the applicants should have experience in excel worksheets.

Council Member Yorke stated she would update the questions reviewed earlier and submit those to Ms. Black within a couple days, and then asked Mr. Perkins his timeline on writing the testing exercise. Mr. Perkins asked for a couple weeks, therefore the Committee chose to meet again on Wednesday, June 15, 2016 at 3:30 p.m.

Ms. Banks asked that the Committee score each interview question, and Council Member Yorke acknowledged she would use the example HR provided to do the scoring. Mr. Perkins asked if the purpose of the test was to pre-screen, and the Committee confirmed, so Mr. Perkins stated he would draft 20 questions and 15 right would be a good qualifier.

The group briefly discussed recruitment and it was suggested to use references, social media, MML, finance and auditing organizations, ALGA, MSU and Davenport and the City website. Mr. Tonney added that Robert Half does to postings and cultivate with people employed and who are looking, and if they are hired there is a 30% fee. Council Member Spitzley acknowledged they need to be broad in their search however not spend a lot of money. Ms. Black stated that the submission to the EEO should list the agencies the ad will be placed.

Council Member Yorke ended the discussions by stated she would forward her proposed timeline on filling the position to the HR department.

#### **ADJOURN**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:25 p.m.

Submitted by, Sherrie Boak, Recording Secretary

Lansing City Council

Approved by the Committee on September 29, 2016